



**KLE Society's Institute of Dental Sciences, Bangalore -22
Department of Orthodontics**

Critical appraisal form for journal club articles.

(Case reports/ Clinical articles)

Date: 01/01/2020

Presented by: Niyosha Rizvi

Citation (Author(s), year, title, Journal, volume, issue, pages):

Zhang M, Liu S, Chen S, Yu F, Zhong C, Huang J, Lu H. Induced ankylosis of primary canines for absolute anchorage in the treatment of a patient with Class III malocclusion and cleft soft palate. Am J Orthod Dentofacial Orthop. 2019 Mar;155(3):398-410.

Title:

Does not include the words 'case report'.

Abstract:

Not structured and does not include keywords.

Introduction/Background:

Well explained about etiology and possible treatment modalities with side effects thus defending chosen treatment plan and need for the intervention described in the case report.

Diagnosis and etiology:

Chief complaint and medical history included.

No previous history of dental treatment reported.

Clinical findings described.

Possible etiologic factors for the clefting not mentioned.

Quantification of growth potential/ CVMI stage not mentioned.

Three-quarter smiling view not included in extra-oral photographs.

Angulation of intra-oral maxillary occlusal photograph not proper.

Treatment objectives:

Clearly stated.

Treatment alternatives:

Clearly explained with various modalities to apply traction force detailed.

Treatment Plan:

Final protocol chosen explained in point-format.

Reasons for choosing selected plan explained.

Grade and level of evidence for treatment plan:

Not specified.

Treatment progress:

Whether the patient gave informed consent is not mentioned.

Explained in detail.

The bracket system used for treatment is not mentioned.

Design and rationale of splint used for ankylosis not mentioned.

Method of determination of ankylosis not mentioned.

Rationale behind alternate use of primary incisors and primary canines not mentioned.

The rationale behind placement of brackets on primary incisors even though they weren't ankylosed is not explained.

The reason why primary molars with a larger root surface area and later shedding were not chosen for ankylosis is not explained.

Three-quarter smiling view not included in extra-oral photographs.

Angulation of intra-oral maxillary occlusal photograph not proper.

Treatment Results:

Satisfactory soft tissue appearance and occlusion.

Changes in cephalometric variables presented.

2 year and 4 year follow up included.

Patient not smiling in post treatment extra-oral photographs.

Maxillary occlusal photograph does not cover maxillary first molars completely in 2 year follow up.

The same photo is used frontal at rest and smiling in four year follow up photographs.

Discussion:

Scientific discussion of strengths included.

No mention of limitations or problems encountered during treatment.

Relevant literature consulted and included with references.

Patient perspective not included.

Conclusions:

Innovative and minimally invasive method for obtaining anchorage discussed by the authors.

New treatment strategy for early intervention of Class III patients.



CARE Checklist of information to include when writing a case report



Topic	Item	Checklist item description	Reported on Line
Title	1	The diagnosis or intervention of primary focus followed by the words "case report"	X
Key Words	2	2 to 5 key words that identify diagnoses or interventions in this case report, including "case report" ...	X
Abstract (no references)	3a	Introduction: What is unique about this case and what does it add to the scientific literature?	✓
	3b	Main symptoms and/or important clinical findings	✓
	3c	The main diagnoses, therapeutic interventions, and outcomes	✓
Introduction	3d	Conclusion—What is the main "take-away" lesson(s) from this case?	X
	4	One or two paragraphs summarizing why this case is unique (may include references)	✓
Patient Information	5a	De-identified patient specific information	✓
	5b	Primary concerns and symptoms of the patient	✓
	5c	Medical, family, and psycho-social history including relevant genetic information	✓
	5d	Relevant past interventions with outcomes	X
Clinical Findings	6	Describe significant physical examination (PE) and important clinical findings	✓
Timeline	7	Historical and current information from this episode of care organized as a timeline	✓
Diagnostic Assessment	8a	Diagnostic testing (such as PE, laboratory testing, imaging, surveys)	✓
	8b	Diagnostic challenges (such as access to testing, financial, or cultural)	X
	8c	Diagnosis (including other diagnoses considered)	✓
	8d	Prognosis (such as staging in oncology) where applicable	X
Therapeutic Intervention	9a	Types of therapeutic intervention (such as pharmacologic, surgical, preventive, self-care)	✓
	9b	Administration of therapeutic intervention (such as dosage, strength, duration)	✓
	9c	Changes in therapeutic intervention (with rationale)	X
Follow-up and Outcomes	10a	Clinician and patient-assessed outcomes (if available)	✓
	10b	Important follow-up diagnostic and other test results	X
	10c	Intervention adherence and tolerability (How was this assessed?)	X
	10d	Adverse and unanticipated events	X
Discussion	11a	A scientific discussion of the strengths AND limitations associated with this case report	X
	11b	Discussion of the relevant medical literature with references	✓
	11c	The scientific rationale for any conclusions (including assessment of possible causes)	✓
	11d	The primary "take-away" lessons of this case report (without references) in a one paragraph conclusion	✓
Patient Perspective	12	The patient should share their perspective in one to two paragraphs on the treatment(s) they received	✓
Informed Consent	13	Did the patient give informed consent? Please provide if requested	X

Yes No

Sumitra
 01/01/20
 Staff-in-charge

Dr. Sumitra

Sumitra
 01/01/20
 Professor & HOD

Dr. Sumitra

